

Midgarth Residents Association

4 Midgarth Close

Oxshott

KT22 0JY

June 28th, 2024

Reference: Elmbridge Planning Application 2024/0189

Dear Ms Adamson,

We are writing to you to comment, and make objections to, the Arboriculture report (attached) that was recently additionally submitted by Mr R Gibbons to yourself on the Elmbridge portal regarding the development of Heath Buildings. There are serious errors and omissions in this report.

TPO's

It is not true, as Mr Gibbons stated, that there are no TPO's on trees at No 1 Midgarth Close. The TPO's are clearly marked in Elmbridge documents as 93/09 both individually and as a group. This is poor research, inaccurate and misleading.

Arboriculture Consultants

The report makes reference to a report by 'Clive Fowler Associates' in January 2024 (updated)

As far as our research can determine, this Company **no longer exists** and did not exist at the time of the report (January 2024). There appears to be no records for this Company listed at Companies House.

<https://www.google.com/search?q=clive+fowler+associates+twickenham&oq=clive+fowler+associates&aqs=chrome.0.69i59l2j69i64j0i512i546l3j69i60l2.517479299j0j15&sourceid=chrome&ie=UTF-8>

(you will need to cut and paste this link into your search engine)

The report also, on close inspection in parts, refers to property not related to Midgarth Close, Oxshott but instead in Kensington, London.

Report Contents

The report from Mr Gibbons is not based on any site visit. For such an important development, we find it incomprehensible that no site visit had been made. This means that trees were not inspected in situ, and in fact (see later) an external, independent tree Consultant has reported that 2 trees are in good health, albeit one

is suffering and does have limited life. It is therefore pure conjecture by Mr Gibbons as to the state of the trees and their roots without an onsite visit.

He also commented that the trees had not been looked after. In fact, the trees have been tended to as recently as late 2023 by a professional tree expert (invoice can be provided on request).

The report also refers to the roots being damaged by the construction of Heath Buildings, yet the Elmbridge chronology suggests that Heath Buildings construction actually predates the trees.

In addition, it attaches a Root Mapping report by Barton Associates (who do exist).

The radar root mapping (November 2021.... not done on the Midgarth site but within Heath Buildings), is incorrect since, on reading, it is clear that the radar assessment was conducted at the incorrect level (elevation). We have contacted Barton Associates and pointed this out to them. No roots would be found at the level that the radar investigation from within Heath Buildings was conducted. In addition, there was no site (No 1 Midgarth Close) visit noted, so the entire root mapping report is questionable. Indeed, the Developer still continues to show on proposed site elevation drawings that the trees at No 1 Midgarth Close are at street (High Street) level. They are not; the trees are at least 2 metres below street level. (and Ms Adamson and Councillors saw this on earlier site visits).

Finally, the end of the report from Mr Gibbons refers to replacing the trees with identical species and sizes if there is any damage to trees in the development process.

We are assuming that this is again simply a 'cut and paste' from a prior, unrelated report, because it is evidently completely impractical to replace mature trees in this instance.

To clarify all these issues, we (Midgarth Residents) have contracted an external tree consultant . This independent consultant has been on site and will submit a report in due course and we would appreciate Elmbridge Council delaying any recommendation until this report becomes available.

Ms Adamson, we have tried to be factual in this letter but it is clear that Mr Gibbons' report is inaccurate in many key aspects and should be discounted in any deliberations as to the development of Heath Buildings in Oxshott.

Yours Sincerely,

Midgarth Residents

KT22 0JY

